

ANALECTA ISISIANA CX

© 2010 The Isis Press & Evangelia Balta

*Published by*  
The Isis Press  
Yazmacı Emine sokak 4/A  
Burhaniye-Beylerbeyi  
34676 İstanbul  
Tel.: (0216) 321 38 51  
Fax.: (0216) 321 86 66  
e-mail: [isis@tnn.net](mailto:isis@tnn.net)  
[www.theisipress.org](http://www.theisipress.org)

First edition 2010

ISBN: 978-975-428-400-3

Baskı: İSİS  
Yazmacı Emine sokak 6  
Burhaniye-Beylerbeyi  
34676 İstanbul  
Tel.: (0216) 321 38 51  
Fax.: (0216) 321 86 66  
e-mail: [isis@tnn.net](mailto:isis@tnn.net)  
[www.theisipress.org](http://www.theisipress.org)

ANALECTA ISISIANA  
CX

Evangelia BALTA

BEYOND THE LANGUAGE  
FRONTIER

Studies on the Karamanlis and the  
Karamanlidika Printing

THE ISIS PRESS  
ISTANBUL

**Evangelia Balta**, born in Kavala in 1955. Studied in the Department of History of the Faculty of Letters at the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki (1973-1977). With a scholarship awarded by the “A.S. Onassis Foundation” she continued her studies at the University of Paris I (Panthéon - Sorbonne) and the École Pratique des Hautes Études, IV Section (1980-83), from where she took her doctorate (1983). She has worked in the Historical Archives of Macedonia (Thessaloniki, 1979) and the Centre for Asia Minor Studies (Athens, 1978, 1984-1987), and has taught at the Ionian University (Corfu, 1985-1987). In 1987 she was appointed Research Fellow at the National Hellenic Research Foundation and from 2000 is Director of Studies, responsible for the Department of the Ottoman Studies, in the same institution. Her interests are wide ranging but focus mainly on the economic history of Greek lands under Ottoman rule and the history of Asia Minor Hellenism.

*To my friend Tassos Karanastassis  
who is always standing behind my choices*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE.....	9
PART ONE: <i>TURKISH-SPEAKING ORTHODOX ANATOLIANS</i> .....	13
I. Les codices karamanlis et turcs du Centre d' Études d'Asie Mineure.....	15
II. <i>Gerçi Rum isekde rumca bilmez</i> . The Adventures of an Identity in the Triptych: Vatan, Religion and Language.....	49
III. Turkish-speaking Anatolian Rums and the Karamanlidika Book Production.....	67
IV. Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books Before the Doom of Silence.....	81
PART TWO: <i>KARAMANLIDIKA PRESS</i> .....	105
V. Karamanlidika Press (Smyrna 1845 – Athens 1926).....	107
VI. Catalogue of the Karamanlidika Press.....	123
VII. La revue karamanlie <i>Aktis</i> [= le Rayon lumineux] Revue périodique hebdomadaire traitant de sujets religieux, politiques et scientifiques.....	135
VIII. La revue karamanlie <i>I Aréti</i> (Fazilet) .....	145
IX. Le journal karamanli <i>Mikra Asia yani Anatoli</i> d'Evangelinos Misailidis dans la tourmente du Schisme Bulgare .....	153
PART THREE: <i>OTTOMAN EVIDENCE ON KARAMANLIDIKA EDITIONS</i> .....	177
X. Ottoman Evidence About the Greek and Karamanli Editions of Evangelinos Misailidis, I .....	179
XI. Karamanlidika editions on Cholera Years, 1848-1854.....	193
XII. Bibliographic notes on Karamanlidika publications, I.....	207



## PREFACE

A volume of *Analecta* (Greek *analegein* = to gather) is always, in a sense, a report on one's work and to some extent one's life if, for better or worse, one's life and work are closely interwoven, as in my case. It has been my choice ...

It is my belief that the work collected in this volume, the writing of which was dictated by different reasons, illustrates the issues which have engaged me in the area of Karamanlidika Studies, my favorite among my various scholarly interests.

As I confessed in writing in 2004, I was forced in my thirties, for both professional and personal reasons, to occupy myself with other areas and periods of Ottoman history. I did not give myself over to Karamanlidika, the object of my scholarly desire with which I had begun my professional career. On the side, amidst on-going research programs and under the pressure of deadlines to produce work at the Institute for Neohellenic Research, I managed to collect and publish the material in the third volume (the sixth according to a different numbering) of the Karamanlidika Bibliography. I also succeeded in writing whatever was published after 1987, when my professional but not scientific relationship with the Center for Asia Minor Studies (CAMS) ceased. Already reprinted and in circulation in two previous volumes of collected work published in *Analecta Isisiana* are articles from the Bulletin of the CAMS which represent the scientific infrastructure for Karamanlidika Studies, such as cataloging of Karamanlidika material housed in the CAMS, as well as of the codices of the Cappadocian communities in the General State Archives (Athens), the collection of Karamanlidika magazines and newspapers in order to make a systematic bibliographical catalogue, as well as some early pioneering studies of Karamanlis and Karamanlidika books.

In 2009, I have received a Senior Fellowship of the Koç University Research Centre for Anatolian Civilizations (RCAC). The fellowship granted me was for Karamanlidika Studies, or you might say, it was thanks to Karamanlidika Studies. The Project I proposed to the RCAC was the re-edition of the Karamanlidika Bibliography which had been begun in 1999 but remained unfinished. Its final treatment was delayed not only because I did not have time to dedicate to the project, but mainly since it required systematic research in the *Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi* in Istanbul. I have been able to give my self over to a much-beloved practice, reading the typed catalogues of the different Fonds of the Archive which are open to researchers, which has been a source of refreshment and revitalization after my attempts to document the specific themes of my research. And, as a result, I am more convinced than ever that the re-edition of the Karamanlidika Bibliography, although it can ever be complete,

should take account of the Ottoman archival material. Of course, this applies also to the Ottoman, Armenian, Armeno-Turkish, Hebrew, Hebrew-Turkish as well as the Greek editions printed in Constantinople. And with regard to the latter, which are of greatest concern to me as a Greek, it is my hope that someone will soon investigate the Ottoman Archive for Greek editions printed at the presses of Constantinople. It is certain that such research would enrich the Corpus of Greek Bibliography with new titles and valuable information.

The likelihood of finding copies of unknown Karamanlidika publications is limited, as was evidenced by the small number located during the intervening years since 1997, when the last volume of the Karamanlidika Bibliography was published. The late Philippos Iliou always said that the notation of copies, the usual foundation of bibliographical research, is not sufficient on its own to establish the true scale of book production. So alongside the search for Karamanlidika books in publishers' catalogs, advertisements and announcements published in newspapers and magazines, and on book covers, we should also be turning our attention to the permits issued by the authorities whereby they allowed the printing and circulation of books, newspapers and magazines within the Ottoman Empire. The various Fonds of the *Maarif Nezâreti* need to be thoroughly investigated. Only in this way may we, perhaps, minimize to the extent it is possible the number of items that has escaped our notice.

By delving into the catalogues I confirmed that the Ottoman archival material also provided information on the circulation of the corresponding Armeno-Turkish and Ottoman editions of a title, thereby contextualizing the Karamanlidika editions within the wider Ottoman world of which they were a product. This may in fact be the most important contribution of the archival source under discussion. Consequently, I have considered it worthwhile to note this material as well since in the re-edition of the Karamanlidika Bibliography I record the corresponding editions - in Ottoman and Armeno-Turkish - to those which circulated in Greek. My goal was and remains to indicate reciprocal interactions on the literary-bibliographical side of the loans and the counter-loans. In the First Conference on Karamanlidika Studies I underlined that 'a desideratum is the study of these three literatures, Karamanlidika, Ottoman, Armeno-Turkish / Daçkeren, in their diachronic and synchronic dimensions, not only because they are part of a whole, but also because this is the only way in which their intersections and peculiarities in periods of important political and social changes within the Ottoman Empire can be enhanced. Furthermore, in the case of the Turcophone Rums, possible influences from the instituting of the Modern Greek State are investigated too. The choices of each literature are articulated with the perception of these changes, and as choices of cultural identity they interpret aspects of the self-determination of the corresponding ethnic culture, in periods distinguished by the quest for identities and the awakening of national consciousnesses.'

The fellowship at the RCAC provided me with the opportunity to immerse myself in the investigation of the countless files in the *Maarif Nezâreti* Archive in order to assemble information related to both published and unpublished Karamanlidika printed material, and not only that pertaining to books but also to newspapers and magazines - forms of documentation which are highly susceptible to the vagaries of time. It was an opportunity to delight in the world

surrounding the production of these materials, their writers, translators, publishers, and printers. Under the extremely difficult working conditions owing to the constant din seeping in from İstiklal Caddesi, where the RCAC is housed, I processed the material collected. Helpmeet in this adventure, from October to December 2009, was the young post-doctoral researcher Raif İvecan, who very quickly honed his skills in treasure hunting and proved an invaluable collaborator. I am indebted to my friend Mehmet Genç for recommending him to me.

My enthusiasm for the material related to the world of Karamanlidika publications which I have been uncovering now for five months in the Ottoman Archive should not mislead the reader into thinking that the present volume is only concerned with the cataloguing of printed material, or that my interest in Karamanlidika Studies is limited to this area of research. Far from it. I have always been interested, and continue to be, above all in the identity, and its expression, of the Turkish-speaking Orthodox population of the East, mainly the Turkish-speaking villages of Cappadocia. I am interested to locate the position of this population within the Orthodox millet and in relation to other millets of the Ottoman Empire, and to trace this network of relationships back as far as possible in time. I think that certain publications which appear in this volume illustrate these interests. But I have always believed, and do so increasingly as time passes, that the preoccupation with such issues should be closely linked to sources, that is, with the material which makes up the constructions. I have sought out such sources and continue searching, in the belief that the discovery of new data, its processing and evaluation is my job as an historian. It is also my work to understand and to help others to understand that the literature on the subject of the origin of the Karamanlis cannot be understood without taking into account the specific conditions under which this literature was created, in other words, without understanding its social, political and the cultural context. The issue of the Karamanlis is a brilliant opportunity to study the attitudes of Greek and Turkish society towards history, and the way a society handles its relations with the past.

And a word on the way in which the texts in the volume are presented. Essentially, the studies in this volume are improved versions of previously published studies. For this reason there are no *Addenda* at the end of them, as was our earlier tactic in our reprinted articles. In most cases, the material in articles has been supplemented during the course of the period between October and December 2009 with new documentation or new bibliography. Even recently completed work drawn from research in the Ottoman Archives has been supplemented subsequent to even more recent surprises uncovered at the eleventh hour before delivery to the printer. Some studies have assumed a more extensive form than the original, which had conformed to the requirements of those who originally requested them (I refer here to studies published in the periodicals *Αρετή* and *Ακτίς*). The Roman numerals which feature in the titles of some articles are intended only to denote that I made a start in some areas of research. May they be a call for its continuation.

I owe many thanks to all those who have been my fellow travelers on the checkered journey of writing the studies in this volume. Some of them are no longer with us. I thank Popi Polemi for always willingly responding to all my

requests regarding issues of Greek Bibliography; my precious friend Eleni Molfesi, the librarian of the Institutes of Byzantine and Neohellenic Studies at the National Hellenic Research Foundation, and Duygu Paçalı of the RCAC, whose unhesitating assistance in my inquiries in the Greek, Turkish and international bibliography was touching. Warm thanks are due to the Directorate and the personnel of the Gennadius Library, for kindly allowing me access to archives still closed to research; to the personnel of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies and, of course, to the personnel of the *Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi*. The presence of my old friend Fuat Recep in the catalogue room is always crucial to finding the information I seek. I owe many thanks to the staff of the ISAM Library, a model library in Turkey, and I am particularly grateful to Fatih Çardaklı, Bilal Çavuşoğlu and Şevki Baykuş for favors that they have done for me. I am also indebted to Murat Altın and Ender Boztürk. I know that they have done all they could to fill the enormous gap left by the loss of Yücel Dağlı. The contribution of my friends Nedret İşli, Püzant Akbaş and Sabri Koz is incalculable, both literally and figuratively. Nikos Chrysidis also has my thanks for his careful concern and willingness to help always and at all stages of research, and during the writing of some of the studies that were born in 2009. To Ilias Anagnostakis, whose judgement I place first, I owe both gratitude and love. Special thanks go to my friends Alex Douma, Elizabeth Key Fowden and Danielle Morichon for translating my texts into English and French. Our collaboration has built strong friendships. They care about my texts and me, and I thank them from the bottom of my heart.

I will close with a salutation: To all those who believe that Karamanlidika Studies is not exclusively about proving whether the Turcophone Greek Orthodox of the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries were of Turkish or Greek-Byzantine origin, but has as its goal other, more important enquiries which have to do with the consciousness of identity and its expression across time. And to all those who do not forget that they are historians.

At the corner of Nuri Ziya sok. and İstiklal Caddesi,  
21 January 2010

*No matter what, day will break  
At seven comes the simitçi*

Beyond the Language Frontier: Studies on the Karamanlis and the Karamanlidika Printing. Istanbul: Isis Press. Kappler, Matthias 1999. The karamanli version was published in five volumes in 1885 just one year after the French edition, one year before the Armenian-Turkish version and five years earlier than the Ottoman version. In this paper, we will focus more specifically on the comparison between the French version and the karamanli translation by trying to figure out if it was a faithful translation or rather a literary, historical and cultural adaptation for the karamanli readers in the Ottoman Empire. La Porteuse de Pain (1884) and (1885). BEYOND THE LANGUAGE FRONTIER Studies on the Karamanlis and the Karamanlidika Printing. PREFACE PART ONE: TURKISH-SPEAKING ORTHODOX ANATOLIANS. Les codices karamanlis et turcs du Centre d'Études d'Asie Mineure II. Gerçeği Rum isekde rumca bilmez. The Adventures of an Identity in the Triptych: Vatan, Religion and Language III. Turkish-speaking Anatolian Rums and the Karamanlidika Book Production. Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books Before the Doom of Silence PART TWO: KARAMANLIDIKA PRESS V. Karamanlidika Press (Smyrna 1845 – Athens 1926) VI. Catalogue of the Karamanlidika Press VII. Beyond the Language Frontier. ebook Studies on the Karamanlis and the Karamanlidika Printing. Analecta Isisiana: Ottoman and Turkish Studies. By Evangelia Balta. Add Book To Favorites. This collection of articles concentrates on the Karamanli people and the Karamanlidika Press of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. It presents and discusses formerly unknown material from the Ottoman archives.